Time Period/	General Description(s) of Withheld Records:	Reason(s) for Withholding of Documents
Type /		
Number of		
Withheld		
Records		
1/2/00 -	Confidential discussions among colleagues regarding	These records have been withheld because they contain
5/27/02	suitability of potential collaborators for contemplated	confidential and candid discussions about potential
	and unpublished research and/or publications;	candidates for collaborative work or potentially vacant
E-mail	confidential discussions among colleagues regarding	positions solicited and responded to upon the express
communication	suitability of potential graduate students and discussion	or implied condition of confidentiality.
and	regarding recommendations of post-doctoral individuals	
attachments	for potential hiring or other work, their experience,	
	attributes and potential limitations; discussions among	
20	colleagues regarding potential vacancies in positions	
	and confidential solicitation of responses with regard to	
	potential candidates and suitability of such potential	
	candidates	
2/25/01 -	Criticism and analysis of Broecker article published in	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
5/4/01	Science (February 22, 2001) between Mann, Hughes,	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	Bradley, Briffa, Jones, Crowley and others regarding	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	climate history and other related issues; confidential	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	discussions among colleagues and collaborators	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	regarding potential for co-authored response to	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	Broecker 2001 article; discussions and analysis of drafts	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	and re-drafts of potential co-authored response to	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
36	Broecker 2001 article	and between university scientists and third-party
		scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

9/10/99 -	Data analysis and discussions regarding data sets	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
3/17/05	between Hughes, Mann, and Bradley; analysis of	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
3/1//03	potentially new data sets to be incorporated into	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	ongoing research and contemplated unpublished	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	research; discussions with regard the various standards	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	utilized by the parties compiling various new data sets	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	or revised data sets, availability of raw data that was	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
attachinents		-
124	compiled for examination of reliability, and discussions	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
124	regarding additional sources of data sets potentially	and between university scientists and third-party
	available for use in continuing or future research and	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	analysis; discussions and analysis of methodologies with	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	regard to algorithms utilized for analyzing various data	maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
	sets	university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
1/13/00 -	Data analysis and discussions regarding potentially	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
5/5/05	available or potentially useful proxy climate data sets	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	between others besides Hughes, Mann, and Bradley	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	including discussions with S. Rutherford, Z. Zhang, Briffa,	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	Jones and others; analysis and discussions of inclusion of	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	various data sets into multiproxy database for use in	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	potential future research and analysis; responses to	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
55	various inquiries and suggestions from other	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
	researchers with regard to new or additional data sets	and between university scientists and third-party
	available for potential inclusion into research and	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	collaborative project involving multiproxy database of	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	climate indicators	maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

10/27/03 -	Discussions and analysis among colleagues regarding	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
2/27/05	McIntyre and McKitrick 2003 article published in Energy	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	and Environment and discussions among original	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	collaborators of 1998 Mann, Bradley, Hughes article	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	published in Nature with regard to the defense of the	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	scientific methodologies utilized, availability of the	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	various data sets in the public domain claimed not to	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	have been made available, examination of claims made	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
337	in article, and critique of the methodology of research	and between university scientists and third-party
	relied upon by McIntyre and McKitrick; discussions	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	between colleagues with regard to potential publication	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	of direct response to McIntyre and McKitrick 2003	maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
	article and drafts and comments with regard to	university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
	potential responses and potential venues for publication	scientists and vice-versa.
	of response by Mann, Bradley and Hughes	
3/9/05 –	Discussions and analysis among colleagues regarding	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
6/16/05	McIntyre and McKitrick 2005 article and discussions	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	among original collaborators of 1998 Mann, Bradley,	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	Hughes article published in Nature with regard to	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	continued defense of analysis, methodologies,	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	availability of data sets, and related matters; discussions	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	among colleagues regarding additional comments	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	published by others on McIntyre and McKitrick's work	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
5	and discussion with regard to additional potential	and between university scientists and third-party
	collaboration regarding further response	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

6/19/04 -	Discussions and analysis among colleagues at various	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
7/8/05	institutions regarding extensive cooperative and	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	collaborative research project revising climate proxy	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	network for updated reviews, analysis and potential	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	publication of future research; discussions of analysis,	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	critique, and comment on various new or updated data	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	sets and discussions of inclusion of various data sets into	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	database for use in potential future research and	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
147	analysis; discussion of criteria for selection of acceptable	and between university scientists and third-party
	climate proxy data sets to be included in collaborative	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	proxy network database	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
11/30/99 -	Discussions and analysis among collaborators (Mann,	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
11/22/00	Gille, Bradley, Hughes, Overpeck, Keimig, & Gross) and	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	discussion of revisions and self-critique by authors of	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	draft article "Global Temperature Patterns In Past	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	Centuries" later published in Earth Interactions in	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	Volume 4 (2000); discussions of unpublished research	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	and revisions and re-revisions of drafts	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
		state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
30		and between university scientists and third-party
		scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

0/15/00	Discussions and evolution encours not out of collebourstons.	These vecende contain unnucleiched date analysis
9/15/00 -	Discussions and analysis among potential collaborators	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
7/31/03	regarding potential grant proposal to NOAA's Office of	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	Global Programs for grant to conduct research regarding	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	global climatic oscillations; numerous discussions	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	regarding paperwork requirements, deadlines, and	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	budgets for grant proposal and other details of creation	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	of grant proposal and grant administration; discussions	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	and analysis among collaborators regarding large scale	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
80	climate reconstruction work and coordination of	and between university scientists and third-party
	research efforts among collaborators pursuant to grant	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	proposal	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
2/18/00 -	Discussions and analysis among colleagues regarding	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
11/3/00	Barnett paper "Detection and Attribution of Recent	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	Climate Change, A Status Report" published in <i>Bulletin</i>	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	of the American Meteorological Society, 80 (12), 2631-	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	2659; discussion and analysis between collaborators	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	Mann, Bradley, Hughes of proposed draft comment on	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	published paper; review and discussion regarding	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	Barnett's analysis and methodology; discussion and	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
30	collaboration regarding drafts and re-drafts of	and between university scientists and third-party
	commentary among collaborators with regard to	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	Barnett paper	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
		scientists and vice-versa.

3/11/03 -	Discussions and analysis among colleagues regarding	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
1/26/04	Soon and Baliunas 2003 articles published in Climate	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
, -, -	Research (Proxy Climatic and Environmental Changes of	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	the Past 1000 Years, vol. 23, 89-110, 2003) and the	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	journal of Energy and Environment (Reconstructing	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	Climatic and Environmental Changes of the Past 1000	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	Years: A Reappraisal, pre-print, published 11 April	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	2003); discussions and analysis of proposed response as	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
83	collaboration among several potential contributing	and between university scientists and third-party
	authors to potential comment; discussions and analysis	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	of drafts among contributing co-authors to comment	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	and reply comment ultimately published by	maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
	collaborating authors in Eos	university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
9/5/01 -	Discussions and analysis among and between colleagues	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
9/27/02	with regard to article published by J. Esper, E.R. Cook, F.	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	H. Schweingruber, Science, 295, 225 (2002); discussions	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	among and between colleagues with regard to the	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	discussion, methodologies, and criticism employed by	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	Esper et. al. and discussion of potential collaboration of	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	conducting review and preparation of a responsive	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	comment; discussion between collaborators with regard	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
70	to analysis and research conducted in review and with	and between university scientists and third-party
	regard to drafts of responsive comment to Esper et. al.	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

7/14/00 -	Discussions, analysis, and self-criticism with regard to	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
9/16/04	research, further potential collaborative research, and	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	potential collaborative article regarding borehole data	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	sets as proxy indicators for surface temperature	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	reconstructions and methodologies for conducting	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	analysis of such data sets; discussions among and	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	between collaborators (Mann, Bradley, Hughes, and	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	Keimig) with regard to research and approaches to	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
177	conducting collaborative research on topic; discussion	and between university scientists and third-party
	and comments regarding multiple rounds of revisions to	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	draft article ultimately entitled "Optimal Surface	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	Temperature Reconstructions Using Terrestrial Borehole	maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
	Data" Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres,	university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
	Vol. 108 Issue D7.	scientists and vice-versa.
11/14/02 -	Discussions, collaboration, and analysis among potential	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
3/9/05	collaborators with regard to potential research and	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	preparation of journal article on intercomparison of	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	proxy-based surface temperature reconstructions;	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	discussions among and between collaborators regarding	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	research, analysis, and drafts of collaborative effort	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	ultimately published as Mann, Michael E., Scott	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	Rutherford, Eugene Wahl, Caspar Ammann, 2005	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
38	(Testing the Fidelity of Methods Used in Proxy-Based	and between university scientists and third-party
	Reconstructions of Past Climate. J. Climate, 18, 4097–	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	4107.	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

3/19/04 -	Discussions, review, and analysis of potential	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
5/6/05	corrigendum to 1998 Mann, Bradley, Hughes article	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
5, 0, 05	published in Nature; discussions and analysis among and	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	between authors of original article with regard to need	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	to provide additional information and citations with	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	•	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
	regard to MBH 1998 as Supplementary Information in	
attachments	form of corrigendum; discussion among and between	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
10	collaborators regarding need and potential form for a	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
49	corrigendum to MBH 1998; discussion regarding drafts	and between university scientists and third-party
	and redrafts of corrigendum to MBH 1998	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
5/23/01 –	Miscellaneous commentary and discussions between	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
6/29/05	colleagues as to articles and papers published by others	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	with regard to climate science topics; miscellaneous	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	discussions and analysis of other parties published	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	material among colleagues and potential collaborators	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	not able to be categorized within another topic or	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	matter	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
		state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
9		and between university scientists and third-party
		scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.

11/17/99 -	Discussion regarding topics to be presented at symposia	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
4/19/04	or talks; discussions among colleagues and potential	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
4/10/04	collaborators regarding potential presentation to be	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	given at symposia; self-critiques by and between	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	collaborators and co-presenters at various symposia	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	with regard to draft presentations and potential topics	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	to be presented	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
		state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
26		and between university scientists and third-party
		scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
		chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.
11/10/00 -	Discussions and comments between co-applicants for	These records contain unpublished data, analysis,
2/2/05	various potential grants; discussions of unpublished	research, results, drafts, self-critical analysis,
	research topics to be provided in grant proposals to	commentary, or other related information or material
E-mail	various grant providing and funding agencies;	that are proprietary in nature and have been withheld
communication	discussions regarding preparation of grant proposals,	pursuant to the provisions of A.R.S. §15-1640(A)(1).
and	strategies in presentations of grant proposals, and	Disclosure of these records would not be in the best
attachments	presentation of potential areas or topics of research in	interests of this state. Instead, the best interests of the
	preparation of preparing grant proposals; drafts and	state are served by promoting scientific collaboration by
74	revisions regarding potential grants, budget matters,	and between university scientists and third-party
	subjects of grants, and form of narrative grant proposals	scientists. Disclosure of these records may have a
	to various grant providing and funding agencies	chilling effect on the ability of universities to attract and
	to various grant providing and funding agencies	
		maintain top researchers and/or on the willingness of
		university scientists to collaborate with third-parties
		scientists and vice-versa.